THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF
BRITISH COLUMBIA

Training and Development in the British Columbia Public Service

SELECT STANDING COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS REPORT

2000

LEGISLATIVE LIBRARY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
3 3298 00244 7911

THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF
BRITISH COLUMBIA

Training and Development in the British Columbia Public Service

Select Standing Committee on
Public Accounts
Report

LEGISLATIVE LIBRARY
VICTORIA BC V8V 1X FEB 2 6 2001

101-03892/

August 9, 2000

To the Honourable,
The Legislative Assembly of the
Province of British Columbia
Victoria, British Columbia

Honourable Members:

I have the honour to present herewith the *Fourth Report* of the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts for the Fourth Session of the Thirty-Sixth Parliament.

The *Fourth Report* covers the work of the Committee on the matter of **Training and Development in the British Columbia Public Service**. Respectfully submitted on behalf o the Committee.

Mr. Rick Thorpe, MLA
Chair

Ms. Evelyn Gillespie, MLA
Deputy Chair

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction **1**

Cross-Government Review **2**

Case Studies **10**

Ministry of Transportation and Highways 10

Ministry of Agriculture and Food 12

Ministry of Attorney General 14

Conclusion **16**

Summary of Committee Recommendations 16

Appendices **17**

Written Submissions, Correspondence, Research Documents 17

INTRODUCTION

In the British Columbia public service, the Public Service Employee Relations Commission ("PSERC") is responsible for directing and monitoring training and development activities. As well, individual ministries and government organizations are responsible for arranging delivery of training and development programs to employees in those organizations. In 1999, the Auditor General conducted an audit in ministries (Crown corporations, agencies, boards and commissions were not audited) to determine whether training and development is being used strategically to maintain "human capital" in B.C.'s public service. He also examined whether any evaluations are taking place regarding the value for money the government receives from its investment in training and development. In particular, in-depth reviews were done in the ministries of Transportation and Highways, Agriculture and Food, and Attorney General.

"Human capital", for the purposes of the audit, was defined as the collective knowledge, skills and experience of an organization's workers. The term was chosen in order to emphasize the value of employees as assets and resources that need to be maintained and protected, as with "physical" capital. However, the committee recognizes the difficulty in placing a monetary value on human capital, and also that the training and development of public service employees must be viewed not just in terms of corporate needs, but also individual needs.

In October and November of 1999, your committee met to consider efforts made by the government to address the 27 recommendations made by the Auditor General regarding training and development in the B.C. public service. Committee members received evidence from representatives of the Office of the Auditor General, the Public Service Employee Relations Commission, and the ministries of Transportation and Highways, Agriculture and Food and Attorney General.

CROSS-GOVERNMENT REVIEW

Human Resource Strategy

Demographics in the British Columbia public service are such that by 2008, at least 51 percent of civil servants will be eligible for retirement. As well, fiscal pressures are requiring that government change the way its business is conducted. Your committee notes that, despite this changing environment, the government has not developed and implemented a strategy for managing its human capital, nor has training and development been incorporated into most ministry strategic plans.

In addition, if human capital in the B.C. public service is to be preserved, it is important that the government assess how much investment in training and development is necessary to preserve its human capital, and establish related benchmarks. This may be done by examining long-term competency requirements, and determining whether there are any performance barriers that may impede further training and development.

The Commissioner of PSERC has emphasized to your committee that as a first step to developing a government-wide human capital strategy, a core competency framework for all government employees, including executives and managers, has been developed and validated, and PSERC has been conducting training needs assessments. Specific competencies for those working in the areas of information technology, finance and human resources are currently underway. Furthermore, the committee welcomes the initiatives of PSERC to promote the inclusion of training planning into normal ministry business planning processes, and to establish a corporate training fund.

The Deputy Ministers' Council in British Columbia has created a Deputy Ministers' Committee on Human Resources, which is in the process of working with PSERC to draft a corporate human resources strategy. Changes in membership in 1999 have resulted in some delay in the work of that group, and your committee urges the Deputy Ministers Committee on Human Resources to place high priority on finalizing a strategy for managing human capital in the B.C. public service in a timely manner.

The British Columbia Public Service as a Learning Organization

Currently, the British Columbia public service is not a "learning organization", as the government has made insufficient commitment, both in terms of hours and funding, to training and developing employees. Despite the fact that approximately $2 billion is spent annually on salaries and benefits for 38,000 employees in the core civil service, an average of less than 1 percent of payroll ($18 million) was spent annually on training and development during the period 1994/95 to 1996/97. In fact, investment in training and development decreased during that period, from $20.9 million in 1994/95 to $16.4 million in 1996/97.

Operational spending freezes have adversely affected training and development in many "knowledge-based" areas of the B.C. public service. For example, there have been instances where employees in professional groups have been prevented from travelling outside the province to gain required expertise in a specialized area, due to out-of-province travel restrictions and travel budget freezes. This has been a concern in areas including legislation drafting, animal pathology, and earthquake engineering.

Furthermore, British Columbia spends an annual average of 22 hours per employee on training and development in the public sector , which is below the Canadian annual average in both public and private sectors of 29 hours .

The government has established an Employee Learning Services office, to strengthen PSERC's ability to tailor training and development decisions to government's strategic and business needs, and to improve resource-sharing. That office, as well as an Employee Learning Board and Training Managers' Advisory Council, are working to promote the coordination of training and development plans with desired business outcomes. Training policies are being revised by PSERC to reflect the emphasis on a "learning culture", and a training plan template is being created for cross-government use. There are also efforts to improve the communication of training-related information, such as through PSERC (Employee Learning Services) quarterly reports to Deputy Ministers regarding training activities, and an improved Employee Learning Services website (www.pserc.gov.bc.ca/els/).

Your committee is of the view that there is clearly a need for a "cultural shift" to ensure that the British Columbia public service remains an attractive calling, and that human capital is maintained for the future. As part of this cultural shift, the government must place top priority on protection of training and development funds, and incorporate training and development requirements into strategic and operational plans.

Methods of Delivering Training and Development

Only about 25 percent of training and development in the B.C. public service is done on an "in-house", classroom setting basis. The remainder of training and development is done outside government institutions, or through methods such as self-paced computerized learning (2 percent) or video-conferencing (2 percent). Given technological advances, and the need to draw members of the younger generation into the public service in British Columbia, your committee is of the view that training and development through computerized learning environments should receive more consideration, where appropriate.

Training and Development for Information Technology Professionals

Investment in training and development for those working in the information technology sector of the B.C. public service has received a higher priority than training and development for those working in other sectors. For example, a central training fund of $3 million has been established for educating information technology employees, based on a per capita training allowance of approximately $2,000. Funds are allocated on the basis of needs assessments conducted by ministries and coordinated by PSERC. Unlike funding for training and development in the B.C. public service generally, training allowances for information technology professionals have remained relatively stable over the last few years.

As a result, B.C. public service employees working in the information technology field receive an average of 44 hours of training per year, as compared with the average 22 hours in the B.C. civil service generally. If similar annual investments of $2,000 per person were made in training and development for the core B.C. public service (38,000 employees), funding would have to increase considerably, to approximately $76 million.

Public Service Training and Development in Other Jurisdictions

A 1999 Conference Board of Canada report states that, on average in Canada, 1.6 percent of payroll is invested in employee training and development. Furthermore, it has been estimated that *Fortune 500* companies spend an average of 3.2 percent, and Japanese companies spend close to 6 percent of payroll on employee training and development.

Other jurisdictions in Canada and internationally have undertaken significant initiatives to renew the public service through increased commitment to training and development. For example, in 1997 the federal government commenced its "La Relève" initiative, aimed at making the federal civil service a learning organization. As part of this initiative, a "Rediscovering Public Service" project has been commenced to broaden awareness of the role played by public servants in delivering quality services to the public. As well, a Canadian Centre for Management Development has been established to develop the management group within federal government. The federal government receives annual reports on the status of the "La Relève" initiative.

Other jurisdictions in Canada are also undertaking initiatives in the area of employee training and development. Examples include Alberta's "Corporate Learning Strategy" and "Executive Management Development Strategy", introduced in 1996/97, Ontario's "Human Resources Plan", and Quebec's legislative requirement that large employers (payrolls in excess of $250,000) invest at least one percent of payroll costs in training. Similar legislative requirements were also introduced in Australia in 1990 (although repealed in 1994).

Your committee believes that, while models in other jurisdictions may not be directly transplanted into British Columbia, the government should continue to examine these models in detail to determine options for creating a learning culture in the B.C. public service.

Assignment of Roles and Responsibilities

As provided in the *Public Service Act*, the Commissioner of PSERC has responsibility for the overall management of training and development of B.C. government employees. While much of this responsibility has been delegated to ministries, the lines

of accountability between the commission and the ministries have not been clear. At the time of the audit, the commission had not developed standards and policies clearly laying out the roles and expectations of ministries respecting training and development, and senior management's responsibilities for managing human capital. However, there is currently an effort underway to address these difficulties, through the revision of training and development policies (including those that address roles and responsibilities). For example, policies pertaining to employee orientation, employee learning and development and reimbursement (outside normal working hours) now include statements of responsibilities. As well, a management curriculum is being developed to deal with managers' human capital responsibilities.

Recording, Monitoring and Evaluating Training and Development Information

Although the *Public Service Act* requires PSERC to audit human resource functions that have been delegated to the ministries, there is currently no audit function. In addition, ministries are not making full use of the Corporate Human Resources Information and Payroll System ("CHIPS") to record the amount and type of training provided in the B.C. public service. CHIPS does include a training administration module, that allows the capture of training data, but compliance with the requirement to enter training data has been a problem. As well, training data has not been entered into the system in a consistent fashion from one ministry to the next. As a result, PSERC has not had enough information to enable it to monitor such activities adequately, and its ability to make accurate comparisons of amounts and types of training provided by ministries has been somewhat impaired.

PSERC has made efforts to establish definitions so that data will be entered in a more consistent manner, and has introduced quarterly reporting to Deputy Ministers on training activities and costs. Quarterly reporting has resulted in some improvement in compliance with data-entry requirements. However, more work is required in this area before PSERC will have the ability to accurately report the amount, cost and type of training being delivered.

Furthermore, evaluations of the effectiveness of training and development in the B.C. public service have focused primarily upon measuring employees' reaction to training and

development activities. Therefore, government has historically had little information regarding whether training is improving individual or organizational performance. Employee Learning Services has recently developed specific evaluation tools to measure how employee training is affecting the workplace, and efforts are being made to upgrade the skills of government trainers.

Your committee believes that PSERC needs to closely monitor compliance with training and development data entry requirements, and consider alternative strategies to achieve compliance if it is determined that progress is not being made in this regard. It is also important that PSERC continue its efforts to measure the impact training and development is having on employees' performance in the workplace.

Development of Management Employees

Management groups within the B.C. public service are dominated by employees in the 42 – 54 age bracket, and there is a serious risk that an increased rate of retirement over the course of the next few years will leave management gaps in the civil service. Therefore, there is a need for government to focus on the development of managers, and to develop a formal management training and development program.

Recently, PSERC has undertaken many initiatives to develop its pool of managers, including the following:

- Establishment of an executive development program aimed at senior managers (within the Management Level 6 through 8 classifications). The aim of the program, which was established in 1999, is to provide participants with management experience in a wide range of operational areas, and to prepare them for potential movement into executive positions. Currently the program is very small, providing for the participation of only 15 individuals, and needs to be expanded;
- Preparation of a plan to implement a management development program, in order to prepare middle managers for more senior management positions;
- Preliminary work to develop supervisor, manager and senior manager curricula based upon competencies;
- Executive Learning Events coordinated by Employee Learning Services and the Institute for Public Administration of Canada.

Your committee encourages the government to implement, on a timely basis, management development programs, and to ensure that executive and management development programs are of sufficient enrolment to address concerns regarding the attrition of managers and executives in the British Columbia public service.

Reporting to the Legislative Assembly

A significant amount of money is allocated to B.C. public sector employees' salaries, yet PSERC's annual report tabled in the Legislative Assembly traditionally has not contained information on the state of human capital within the British Columbia public service. However, your committee is pleased to note that, as a result of the commencement of quarterly reporting of training and development activities to Deputy Ministers, human capital information will now be included in PSERC's annual report. Committee members believe that it is important that PSERC continue to develop more comprehensive reporting on human capital, and include such information in its annual report.

Change Management Strategies

Fiscal restraint in the B.C. public sector in recent years has meant reorganization and downsizing in many ministries. However, change management strategies which incorporate training and development requirements have not been established to assist remaining employees in carrying out their work in the face of such changes. To address this problem, PSERC has included "change management and transition" in the core competencies that have been developed for supervisors and managers, and is expecting to include a "Managing Change" program in the management curriculum currently being developed. Supervisors and managers will be expected to lead change processes and work improvements within business units, and to encourage development of new and/or modified approaches to help employees deal with change as they carry out their work.

Contract Management Training

In recent years, there has been a transformation in the way government has carried out its work. In particular, there has been a shift toward service-delivery by contractors, and a resulting need for government employees to be competent in the area of contract management. However, although government is increasingly "steering, not rowing", training and

development in this area has not been occurring at an appropriate level. The government offers two courses in this area, entitled "Managing Government Contracts" and "Service Management for Long Term Contracts". However, the Auditor General found that in the Ministry of Transportation and Highways, 34 percent of contract managers and 58 percent of professional engineers (many of whom have significant contract management responsibilities) had not taken the contract management training courses offered in the B.C. public service. PSERC is currently investigating the possibility of developing a broader "Government Outsourcing" program for managers, which will include a contract management component.

Your committee believes that if government is to ensure that services delivered by contractors are meeting government standards, and being delivered in a cost-effective and timely manner, staff must be given appropriate training and development in the area of contract management. Committee members urge the government to ensure that this training and development is occurring at the appropriate levels.

CASE STUDIES

As part of his audit, the Auditor General conducted in-depth reviews of the management of training and development in the ministries of Transportation and Highways, Agriculture and Food, and Attorney General. As in other government organizations, challenges in these ministries include fiscal restraint, increased outsourcing and an aging workforce. These challenges have illuminated the need to develop formal management training and development programs, hold managers accountable for staff training and development, develop change management strategies which incorporate training and development requirements, and provide mandatory training in the area of contract management.

MINISTRY OF TRANSPORTATION AND HIGHWAYS

Adequacy of Training and Development

The Auditor General's review of the Ministry of Transportation and Highways focused upon the training and development of professional engineers and contract managers.

In the Ministry of Transportation and Highways, increased use of contractors, particularly in the areas of road design, construction and maintenance, has required that ministry staff develop skills and knowledge in areas such as contract negotiation, team-building, contract law, quality assurance and quality control. However, contract managers and professional engineers have not been receiving sufficient training in these areas to enable them to ensure that work is being done to ministry standards. Budget cutbacks in recent years have also meant that contract management training for field staff in some more rural areas of the province has suffered.

The committee was pleased to hear that the ministry is now placing increased emphasis on contract management training for staff monitoring maintenance contracts, including staff in rural areas such as the South Peace District, where most staff have received formal training. However, your committee is of the view that this is an area that must be monitored, to ensure that cutbacks in other areas such as travel budgets do not affect training.

The ministry also needs to develop a human resource strategy to address the risk of human capital erosion, and to establish core competencies for contract managers and professional engineering staff to assist in evaluating how training programs are impacting upon job and overall ministry performance. It is important that these evaluations take place, in order that training and development can be reported annually to the Legislative Assembly.

Action Plan

The ministry has developed an action plan with associated target dates and lead offices to address recommendations arising from the audit. The ministry is in the process of:

- Establishing a ministry Training Advisory Committee to coordinate an update of the current human resource strategy to better reflect management of and investment in human capital. Ministry strategic plans and business plans are also incorporating training and development as priorities;
- Completing a training needs analysis, based on surveys done in 1998 and 1999;
- Participating in the initiative by Employee Learning Services to develop a framework for core competencies. The ministry plans to give priority to establishing specific competencies for contract managers and professional engineers;
- Conducting a pilot project to evaluate the impact of training on job performance;
- Developing a training reference guide to assist managers in linking training to performance and core competencies, and evaluating the effectiveness of training;
- Reporting by the Human Resources Branch to ministry executive regarding training and development activities and human capital management. This information will be included in the ministry's annual report as well.

Although the ministry currently has a number of initiatives underway to address training and development issues, your committee is concerned that training and development remain a high priority for the ministry, particularly in times of fiscal restraint. The Auditor General has estimated that for fiscal 1996/97, only 0.3 percent of the ministry's payroll costs were invested in training and development. This figure is well below the average annual investments of just below one percent in the B.C. public service, and 1.6 percent in the private and public sectors across Canada. Moreover, in 1997/98 the ministry's

corporate and operational training budget was reduced by more than 50 percent to $50,000 for 2,600 employees. While this budget has since been increased to $150,000 in 1999/2000, as have regional operational training budgets, the committee looks to the government to ensure that sufficient resources continue to be dedicated to training and development in the ministry.

MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE AND FOOD

Adequacy of Training and Development

The Ministry of Agriculture and Food plays a significant role in providing professional support and guidance to the agriculture industry in British Columbia, and therefore much of the work done by its employees is "knowledge-based". The ministry employs many professional and technical staff, including veterinarians, agrologists, engineers, laboratory technicians, financial and insurance experts, and scientific authorities in various areas of agriculture. In recent years, the ministry has been operating in an increasingly complex policy environment that requires employees to be familiar with areas such as international trade, environmental regulations, animal disease, and marketing. It has also been engaged in the process of developing an agri-food policy for British Columbia. This increasingly complex environment, as well as implementation of significant budget reductions beginning in November 1996 (18 percent budget reduction) has resulted in re-organization, downsizing and the departure of experienced employees.

The ministry has delegated human resource services and training to other ministries and to regional staff. The Ministry of Transportation and Highways is now providing advice on human resource strategy, course development, training and development communications, and methods of delivery. However, the service agreement with the Ministry of Transportation and Highways had not been put into writing at the time of the audit (1997), and there was no one with overall responsibility for monitoring employee training and development to ensure value for money, or for reporting training and development activities to ministry executives.

The ministry has also failed to use training and development strategically to assist with change management, and is placing the skill base of its managers and professional staff at risk due to inadequate levels of training. Finally, the ministry has not

developed a strategic human capital plan, and has not been reporting to the Legislative Assembly on human capital issues.

The ministry significantly increased its training budget for transferable skills since the time of the audit in 1997, to $160,0000 in fiscal 1999/2000. However, $120,000 of this was allocated to information technology training, with the remaining funds for regional staff training ($30,000) and "centrally-mandated and cross-ministry training" ($10,000).

Impact of Travel Budget Freezes on Training and Development in the Ministry of Agriculture and Food

There appear to be ongoing challenges in the area of professional development of ministry staff, due to cross-government travel budget freezes. However, there has been improvement in this area in recent years, with $158,033 being spent from branch travel budgets over the fiscal years 1998/99 and 1999/2000 on staff attendance at professional development conferences. In addition, during the same period of time $51,240 was contributed for this purpose by agriculture industry associations. There are also initiatives to allow ministry employees to benefit from training offered by the federal government, such as work done in the horticultural area at the Summerland Research Station. The ministry also tries to promote more cost-effective training and development options, such as video-conferencing and joint delivery of training in more rural areas of the province.

Recent Ministry Initiatives

The ministry is in the preliminary stages of formulating an action plan to address concerns raised by the 1997 audit. Your committee recognizes that there is still much work to be done by the ministry in developing human resource and change management strategies, conducting training and development needs assessments, and establishing lines of accountability, and the committee urges the ministry to act in a timely manner to address its training and development challenges.

MINISTRY OF ATTORNEY GENERAL

Adequacy of Training and Development

The Auditor General's review of human capital issues in the Ministry of Attorney General focused upon deputy sheriffs and middle managers throughout all branches of the ministry (Management Levels 3 – 8, inclusive). He found that in both management and deputy sheriff occupational groups within the ministry there has been insufficient commitment to training and development, insufficient assessment and evaluation of the impact of training and development on performance, and no accountability information provided in the ministry's annual report to the Legislative Assembly regarding training and development.

The Ministry of Attorney General is one of the largest ministries in the province of British Columbia, employing 6,000 people, and having a budget in 1999/2000 of over $900 million. Like the ministries of Transportation and Highways, and Agriculture and Food, the Ministry of Attorney General has experienced significant reorganization and downsizing in recent years, as a result of fiscal restraint and justice system reforms intended to improve efficiency. This has magnified the need for managers to have well-developed leadership skills, and for the ministry to conduct a ministry-wide training and development needs assessment to ensure that training and development allocation decisions are made based on all relevant information. While the ministry does not yet have core competencies identified for management staff, the Employee Learning Services' Curriculum Advisory Committee for Supervisors, Managers and Executives is in the process of developing such competencies on a government-wide basis.

Your committee also notes that the preventive/protective nature of deputy sheriff positions requires skills in the areas of security and jury management, and yet little refresher training is provided to deputy sheriffs. This lack of refresher training creates a risk that skills learned during basic training will deteriorate over time, placing branch employees, prisoners, stakeholders and deputy sheriffs themselves at risk. Your committee is pleased to learn that some steps have been taken in this regard. The Court Services Branch has created the position of Director of Training and Development to develop a branch training plan, and establish training standards for deputy sheriff training programs. Significant work has also been done to improve firearms training.

Human Resources and Training Strategies

The ministry's "Supportive Workplace Committee" has been charged with responsibility for drafting a ministry human resources strategy. The human resources strategy has been approved in principle, and is now before the Supportive Workplace Committee for implementation. Six priorities have been set for 1998/99, including succession planning, recruitment and retention, and linking human resource planning to business planning. Furthermore, a training strategy has been developed and approved. That strategy proposes the establishment of performance standards and core competencies (particularly for supervisory and managerial levels), to assist in determining training requirements and developing evaluation methods to test the effectiveness of training. Because the ministry is such a large and decentralized organization, the strategy also identifies the need to establish a regional training strategy, so that training is delivered to employees outside major urban centres. In this regard, the ministry has embarked upon a pilot project to assess various types of training delivery. A project has also been completed to identify specific steps required to implement the strategy's principles. The results of that project will be considered in development of the ministry's annual training plan for 2000/2001.

Provision has also been made to train employees who have been moved into other ministries as a result of reorganization (i.e.) youth probation staff, who are now part of the Ministry for Children and Families.

Training and Development Funding in the Ministry of Attorney General

When the Auditor General's work was done in 1997, it was revealed that for the fiscal year 1996/97, the ministry invested 0.9 percent of its payroll costs in training and development. This figure is comparable with average annual investments made in training and development across the B.C. public service. Since that time, the ministry's total training budget (including training delivered through the Justice Institute and training-related travel, but excluding Provincial Emergency Program and Police Academy training) increased from $2,808,917 for 1998/99 to $3,240,762 for 1999/2000. However, the committee is aware that budget cutbacks from 1997/98 to 1998/99 affected the Court Services Branch's ability to delivery training beyond mandatory deputy sheriff requirements.

CONCLUSION

Committee members are concerned that although government positions are becoming increasingly "knowledge-based" and specialized, and government has been experiencing significant reorganization, downsizing and shifting demographics, there is insufficient succession planning, strategic management of training and development funds, and commitment to training and development taking place in the B.C. public service. Your committee believes that continuous learning must be an essential component of corporate strategy in the B.C. public service, and strongly urges the government to place a high priority upon ensuring that public service employees have an appropriate sense of job satisfaction, and are well-equipped to provide quality services to British Columbians, now and in the future.

Summary of Committee Recommendations

1. Your committee endorses the 27 recommendations made by the Auditor General in his 1999/2000 Report 3, entitled "Maintaining Human Capital in the British Columbia Public Service: The Role of Training and Development".

2. Your committee recommends that representatives of the Deputy Ministers' Council report to this committee by October 1, 2000 regarding progress made in implementing the Auditor General's 27 recommendations.

APPENDICES

I - Written submissions

- Office of the Auditor General of British Columbia, "Maintaining Human Capital in the British Columbia Public Service: The Role of Training and Development" (presentation to the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts), October 27, 1999
- British Columbia, Ministry of Transportation and Highways, "Presentation to the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts", October 27, 1999
- British Columbia, Public Service Employee Relations Commission, "Maintaining Human Capital Audit Recommendations – Current Activities" (presentation to the Select Standing Committee on Public Accounts), October 27, 1999

II - Correspondence

- Correspondence from Har Singh, Assistant Deputy Minister, Ministry of Transportation and Highways, dated November 17, 1999
- Correspondence from Marg Arthur, Deputy Minister, Ministry of Agriculture and Food, dated November 1, 1999

III - Research Documents

- Public Service Employee Relations Commission, "Deputy Minister's 2nd Quarterly Report on Government-Wide Training for 1999/00", November 5, 1999
- Public Service Employee Relations Commission, "Deputy Minister's 1st Quarterly Report on Government-Wide Training for 1999/00", August 23, 1999
- Public Service Employee Relations Commission, "B.C. Public Service Core Competency Framework", undated
- Public Service Employee Relations Commission, Employee Learning Services, "1999/2002 Business Plan"
- Ministry of Attorney General, "Ministry Training Strategy", dated October 13, 1999
- Ministry of Attorney General, "Training Budget Report, 1996/97 – 1999/00"
- Ministry of Agriculture and Food, "Training Report – Fiscal 1998/99", "Training Report – Fiscal 1997/98"
- Victorian Auditor-General's Office, "A Competent Workforce – Professional Development", 1999

- Government of Canada, Parliamentary Research Branch, Brian O'Neal, "Reorganizing Government: New Approaches to Public Service Reform", January 1994
- Government of Canada, Parliamentary Research Branch, "Federal Public Service Renewal – The La Relève Initiative", Jack Stilborn, November 1998
- Auditor General of Canada, "Report of the Auditor General of Canada – April 2000", *Streamlining the Human Resource Management Regime: A Study of Changing Roles and Responsibilities*
- United States General Accounting Office, "Federal Workforce: Payroll and Human Capital Changes During Downsizing", August 1999